

CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS MAYOR'S OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

Joseph A. Curtatone

Mayor

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

KRISTENNA CHASE, PRESERVATION PLANNER SARAH WHITE, PLANNER & PRESERVATION PLANNER Case #: HPC 2017.087 Date: December 19, 2017

Recommendation: Preferably Preserved

PRESERVATION STAFF REPORT

for

Determination of Preferably Preserved

Site: 108 Gilman Street

Applicant Name: Bonnie McCarthy

Applicant Address: 13 Princeton Street, Medford,

MA

Owner Name: Same Owner Address: Same

Petition: Applicant seeks to demolish the c. 1840

post and beam residence.

HPC Hearing Date: December 19, 2017



I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

- 1. <u>Subject Property:</u> The subject property is a c.1840 post and beam residence owned by Charles E. Gilman, first Town Clerk and City Clerk.
- 2. **Proposal:** The Applicant seeks to demolish the existing structure.
- I. MEETING SUMMARY: Determination of Significance

On Tuesday, March 20, 2018, the Historic Preservation Commission voted unanimously (6-0) to determine the pre-1850 wood-frame building at 108 Gilman Street 'Significant' because the building, per Section 2.17.B of the Demolition Review Ordinance 2003-05, is "at least 50 years old, and is or has been determined by the Commission to be a significant building or structure after a finding that the building or structure is either:

- i. "Importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the broad architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the City or the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, or
- ii. "Historically or architecturally significant (in terms of period, style, method of building construction, or association with a reputed architect or builder) either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures, and therefore it is in the public interest to be preserved or rehabilitated rather than to be demolished."

The subject building is found <u>importantly associated</u> one or more historic persons and with the broad architectural, cultural, economic and social history of the City due to associations with Charles E. Gilman, the first Town (1842-1871) and City Clerk (1872-1882), and with working class families from 1882 to the present.

The subject building is found historically and architecturally significant due to its possible post and beam construction, early 19th century form and massing. The building is unusual in its simplicity of design and size due to its age and located in a group of later larger late Victorian Era buildings. It retains the integrity and form of an early 19th century house. It is prominently located at the corner of Gilman and Walnut Streets across from the Ed Leathers Park.

II. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

A site visit on March 27, 2018 revealed that the house is definitely of post and beam construction. Corner posts were clearly visible on the first and second floors as were beams on the second floor. The beams between the first and second floors were not visible, being located between the ceiling and floor. Beams in the attic showed evidence of being hand-hewn. This indicates that the building may be older than initially proposed. The building appears that it was raised up at one point to allow for full basement use, possibly in the 1920s when the building was also used for automotive purposes. Thick lower walls give way to a narrower wall type above grade. The side shed has salvage metal ceiling tiles lining the space. Lally columns support the structure.

Comparable Structures:

There are few structures to compare with the subject dwelling due to the combination of the age of the structure, and the construction technique. The properties below are known to be post and beam construction. All are earlier than 1800.



78 Sycamore Street, Oliver Tufts House, c. 1714 (LHD); 6 Kent Court, c. 1750 (LHD); 438 Broadway, Adams-Magoun House c. 1783 (LHD)



Above: 117 Washington Street, Samuel Ireland House, c. 1792 (LHD); 81 Eustis Street, Cooper Davenport Tavern, c. 1808 (LHD); 45 Nashua Street, unknown date, moved to current location.

Below: 461 Somerville Avenue, Jonathan Ireland House c. 1791.



II. PREFERABLY PRESERVED

If the Commission determines that the demolition of the significant building or structure would be detrimental to the architectural, cultural, political, economic, or social heritage of the City, such building or structure shall be considered a preferably preserved building or structure. (Ordinance 2003-05, Section 4.2.d)

A determination regarding if the demolition of the subject building is detrimental to the architectural, cultural, political, economic, or social heritage of the City should consider the following:

How does this building or structure compose or reflect features which contribute to the heritage of the City?

- a) What is the remaining integrity of the structure? The National Park Service defines integrity as the ability of a property to convey significance.
 - The exterior of the structure retains a high degree of architectural integrity and reflects the evolution of this. See determination of significance report for a summary of the historic architectural features of this structure.

What is the level (local, state, national) of significance?

- The subject building is found <u>importantly associated</u> one or more historic persons and with the broad architectural, cultural, economic and social history of the City due to associations with Charles E. Gilman, the first Town (1842-1871) and City Clerk (1872-1882), and with working class families from 1882 to the present.
- The subject building is found historically and architecturally significant due to its possible post and beam construction, early 19th century form and massing. The building is unusual in its simplicity of design and size due to its age and located in a group of later larger late Victorian Era buildings. It retains the integrity and form of an early 19th century house.

- b) What is the visibility of the structure with regard to public interest (Section 2.17.B.ii) if demolition were to occur?
 - The structure is prominently located at the corner of Gilman and Walnut Streets across from the Ed Leathers Park is set back from the street with a large front yard.
- c) What is the scarcity or frequency of this type of resource in the City?
 - The City of Somerville has few structures from the early days of Somerville. When Somerville separated from Charlestown in 1842, the population was a mere 1,013. Just 7 buildings are known to be constructed of post and beam and only 19 pre-1842 buildings are on the Local Historic Districts list

Upon a consideration of the above criteria is the demolition of the subject building detrimental to the architectural, cultural, political, economic, or social heritage of the City?

Staff finds that 108 Gilman Street is a rare example of early Somerville homes. While the building's early history is not known, its construction technique is rare and evidence of the construction early date.

III. RECOMMENDATION

Based on the information provided and an assessment of the building, Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission finds the property at 108 Gilman Street to be PREFERABLY PRESERVED.





Corner post ground floor north



Corner post second floor south with beam visible, mid- 18th century newel post at top of stairs



Mid-18th century newel post and balusters.







Massachusetts Cultural Resource Information System

Scanned Record Cover Page

Inventory No: SMV.497

Historic Name: Gilman, Charles E. House

Common Name:

Address: 108 Gilman St

City/Town: Somerville
Village/Neighborhood: Winter Hill

Local No:

Year Constructed: r 1840

Architect(s):

Architectural Style(s): No style

Use(s): Single Family Dwelling House

Significance: Architecture

Area(s):

Designation(s):

Building Materials(s):Roof: Asphalt Shingle
Wall: Wood; Wood Shingle



The Massachusetts Historical Commission (MHC) has converted this paper record to digital format as part of ongoing projects to scan records of the Inventory of Historic Assets of the Commonwealth and National Register of Historic Places nominations for Massachusetts. Efforts are ongoing and not all inventory or National Register records related to this resource may be available in digital format at this time.

The MACRIS database and scanned files are highly dynamic; new information is added daily and both database records and related scanned files may be updated as new information is incorporated into MHC files. Users should note that there may be a considerable lag time between the receipt of new or updated records by MHC and the appearance of related information in MACRIS. Users should also note that not all source materials for the MACRIS database are made available as scanned images. Users may consult the records, files and maps available in MHC's public research area at its offices at the State Archives Building, 220 Morrissey Boulevard, Boston, open M-F, 9-5.

Users of this digital material acknowledge that they have read and understood the MACRIS Information and Disclaimer (http://mhc-macris.net/macrisdisclaimer.htm)

Data available via the MACRIS web interface, and associated scanned files are for information purposes only. THE ACT OF CHECKING THIS DATABASE AND ASSOCIATED SCANNED FILES DOES NOT SUBSTITUTE FOR COMPLIANCE WITH APPLICABLE LOCAL, STATE OR FEDERAL LAWS AND REGULATIONS. IF YOU ARE REPRESENTING A DEVELOPER AND/OR A PROPOSED PROJECT THAT WILL REQUIRE A PERMIT, LICENSE OR FUNDING FROM ANY STATE OR FEDERAL AGENCY YOU MUST SUBMIT A PROJECT NOTIFICATION FORM TO MHC FOR MHC'S REVIEW AND COMMENT. You can obtain a copy of a PNF through the MHC web site (www.sec.state.ma.us/mhc) under the subject heading "MHC Forms."

Commonwealth of Massachusetts
Massachusetts Historical Commission
220 Morrissey Boulevard, Boston, Massachusetts 02125
www.sec.state.ma.us/mhc

This file was accessed on: Monday, February 12, 2018 at 2:22: PM

FORM B - BUILDING

MASSACHUSETTS HISTORICAL COMMISSION 294 Washington Street, Boston, MA 02108

Recorded by <u>Carole Zellie</u>

Organization Landscape Research

4/80

PI, WINTER	
US155 - BOST/N	
SEUT B	

Area	Form no.
inter Hill	497

Date

Approx. acreage less than one acre

Setting_ urban residential

	own_Somerville
	ddress 108 Gilman
	storic Name Charles Gilman House
	e: Original residential
	Present residential
	nership: Private individual Private organization
	Public
	Original owner Charles Gilman.
	a constant and the cons
	SCRIPTION:
cross streets and other buildings	Dateca. 1838-1845
or geographical features. Indicate north.	Source map research, directory research
on Welnut Street (1874 Arlas) in the 1850s.	StyleFederal
	Architect
	Exterior wall fabric shingle
L	Outbuildings
D 7	
GILMAN	Major alterations (with dates)
A	

Moved

ARCHITECTURAL SIGNIFICANCE (describe important architectural features and evaluate in terms of other buildings within community)

Simple five bay facade, central entry house is one of the earliest surviving houses in the Gilman Square area.

HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE (explain the role owners played in local or state history and how the building relates to the development of the community)

Charles E. Gilman (1809-1888) was born in Shrewsbury. He held jobs with the Boston and Lowell Railroad and the New England Bank of Boston. He moved to Somerville in 1838 and was town and city clerk for over forty years. Gilman Square is named for him. Gilman owned considerable acreage in the Walnut Street area, and appears to have owned another later house on Walnut Street (1874 Atlas) however, this probably was his residence in the 1850s.

BIBLIOGRAPHY and/or REFERENCES

1857 Walling Map Hopkins, G.M. Atlas of the City of Somerville, 1874 Samuels, E. Someraville Past and Present, 1897, p. 543